

#### MASCULINITIES AND GENDER EQUALITY:

RESULTS FROM THE INTERNATIONAL MEN AND GENDER EQUALITY SURVEY (IMAGES) IN BOLIVIA





#### WHY A SURVEY ON MEN AND GENDER EQUALITY IN BOLIVIA?

Compared to other Latin American countries, Bolivia ranks poorly in key indicators on violence against women and children, as well as men's participation in unpaid care work.

While these issues are all rooted in inequitable gender norms, they are seldom examined using a gender-transformative approach or with the understanding that engaging men is the key to change.

### 53%

Percent of Bolivian women ages 15-49 who have suffered physical or sexual intimate partner violence (WHO, 2018)



Amount of time women spend on unpaid work compared to men (World Bank, 2015)

### 21%

Percent of women ages 15+ who have suffered physical intimate partner violence in the last year (<u>GiZ & INE, 2016</u>)

#### 4 out of 5 women & 3 out of 4 men

Use harsh punishment against children, whether corporal punishment, scolding, or intentional neglect (ENDSA, 2008)

#### **RESPONDING TO THE CALL FOR EVIDENCE**

- In 2019, Promundo and our partner CEGIE-UPB, with support from the Embassy of Sweden in Bolivia, conducted the country's first ever International Men and Gender Equality Survey (IMAGES).
- This project sought to build an evidence base on the gendered realities of daily life in Bolivia and clarify their connections to masculinities, gendered attitudes, and the norms that uphold inequalities.
- The IMAGES Survey, co-created with the International Center for Research on Women in 2008, is a global effort to create actionable evidence that guides actors at all levels to successfully and sustainably engage men and boys in achieving gender equality.

 IMAGES Bolivia adds to the global repository of 40+ countries where IMAGES data have been collected to date.



## METHODOLOGY: HOW WAS THE IMAGES BOLIVIA SURVEY CONDUCTED?

**THE SAMPLE** was drawn using proportional to population sampling (PPS) and is nationally and regionally representative. It includes 1,779 Bolivian men and women ages 18-59 from the full Bolivian territory.

**THE SURVEY** tool was developed in consultation with an advisory team of experts and adapted to respond to the most pressing evidence gaps.

**FIELDWORK** was completed between April and May of 2019 by a team of interviewers who underwent a 10-day hands-on training complete with practical instruction on ethical conduct in research. **DATA ANALYSIS** relied on sex disaggregated bivariate and multivariate regression models to identify links between experiences, attitudes, and practices and expose the complexity of gendered realities in Bolivia. All data is weighted.

**ETHICS APPROVAL** was granted by the Institutional Review Board at the International Center for Research on Women (ICRW).

## RESULTS: WHAT DOES IMAGES TELL US ABOUT GENDER AND MASCULINITIES IN BOLIVIA?

### PERCEPTIONS OF GENDER ROLES AND RELATIONS

- What are the most prevalent opinions about gender equality?
- How do Bolivians define masculinities?
- What gender roles do they defend or challenge?

#### AT FIRST GLANCE, A HIGH NUMBER OF BOLIVIANS EXPRESS PROGRESSIVE VIEWS ON GENDER EQUALITY.

Both men and women reject the notion that progress on gender equality threatens or undermines men's position or rights in society.

#### Disagree or strongly disagree that... 83% "...more rights for women means that men lose out." 85% " better 83% opportunities for women means worse opportunities 89% for men." "...when women work, they 93% are taking jobs away from men." 89%

Men Women

#### BUT MANY VOICE MORE CONSERVATIVE VIEWS WHEN ASKED ABOUT MEN'S AND WOMEN'S ROLES AT HOME...

More than half of men and women think that "the most important role for a woman is to take care of her home and cook for the family."



#### ... AND WHO SHOULD BE ABLE TO EXERCISE POWER IN THE HOUSEHOLD.

Approximately 2 in 5 men and women (22% and 18% respectively) believe that "men should have the final word about decisions in the home."



Men



SOME WOMEN - RAISED AND SOCIALIZED IN PATRIARCHAL ENVIRONMENTS JUST LIKE THE MEN - BUY INTO AND UPHOLD THESE RIGID GENDERED ROLES, AT TIMES MORE FERVENTLY THAN THE MEN THEMSELVES.

## **30%** OF WOMEN

(vs. 18% of men) agree that "changing diapers, bathing, and feeding kids are the responsibility of the mother, not the father."

**2X** MORE WOMEN THAN MEN agree that "women are responsible for avoiding pregnancy."

Women's degree of support of inequalities at their own detriment shows how deeply these gendered norms can permeate communities. It also exposes how women can assert themselves and hold on to authority in the spaces where they have historically held it. ON THE OTHER HAND, MANY MEN DEFEND HYPERSEXUALITY, HETERONORMATIVITY, AND HOMOPHOBIA AS PILLARS OF MASCULINITY...

Men agree or strongly agree that... 23% "...men need sex more than women." "...men are always ready to 40% have sex." 39% "...gay men aren't 'real men."

#### ... AND SOME EVEN JUSTIFY THE USE OF VIOLENCE AGAINST GAY MEN.

**9%** AGREE that physically or verbally attacking a homosexual man would be justified *"if they were kissing a man in public."* 

**9%** AGREE that violence would be justified "if that person were staring at them or wouldn't stop looking at them."

**16%** AGREE that attacking a gay man would be justified *"if they were trying to flirt or seduce them."* 

## WHAT ABOUT SUPPORT FOR WOMEN IN POLITICS?

Bolivia is known for being the first country in the region, and one of the first in the world, to achieve political parity. Both men and women express support for equal representation of women and men in the plurinational legislative assembly. Percentage of men and women who agree or strongly agree with parity in leadership positions:

Is in favor of Law 243 guaranteeing the alternation of men and women in government positions, ensuring that women have access to high positions in government of political organizations.

Is in favor of guaranteeing equal participation (50% of men and women) in government.



Men Women

#### HOWEVER, MANY STILL HOLD STEREOTYPICAL IDEAS ABOUT MEN'S INNATE LEADERSHIP ABILITIES.

Agree or strongly agree that...

"Women are too emotional to be leaders."

"Men make better leaders than women."



46%

33%

Men Women

#### **QUICK TAKEAWAYS:** Gender Roles and Relations

- There is evidence of increasing support for gender equality, but the path to change is incomplete and inconsistent.
- Men's (and often also women's) beliefs about gender equality are full of contradictions.
  - Most people support equality as an abstract concept, but in many cases that support drops when they are asked about equality's practical applications.
  - Despite progressive change, attitudes around gender norms remain quite conservative.

- This is reflected in how people (and particularly men) contribute to their families and care for others.
  - They generally report that they are very much in favor of gender progress, but only insofar as it does not endanger the status quo.
- The survey also shows that some people buy into stereotypes about the capabilities of people of different genders, demonstrating the need to address problematic traditional gender roles, bring nuance to the concept of gender, and continue to build awareness of gender norms with the intent to make them more equitable.

### FATHERHOOD: GENDER, CAREGIVING AND DOMESTIC CHORES

- What are men's views and practices regarding fatherhood and domestic work?
- What were their models like growing up?
- What do women think of men's current participation in and contribution to domestic life?

#### MOST BOLIVIANS REPORT GROWING UP WITHOUT A MODEL OF MALE PARTICIPATION IN THE DOMESTIC SPHERE.

Fewer than one in three men and one in four women remember their fathers or other male figures contributing to domestic chores in their childhood home.

Respondents who said their fathers (or other male caregivers in their childhood home) seldom or never contributed to preparing food, cleaning the house or toilet, or washing clothes.



MODELS OF INVOLVED AND CARING FATHERHOOD WERE ALSO NOTABLY ABSENT FROM MANY BOLIVIAN CHILDHOODS. Almost half of Bolivian men report that their fathers seldom or never took care of them or their siblings when they were children.



#### INEQUITABLE ROLE MODELING DURING CHILDHOOD STRONGLY INFLUENCES MEN'S BELIEFS AND ACTIONS AS ADULTS.

**2X** MORE MEN who had uninvolved male role models at home (vs. those who did grow up with a positive role model) think that "a man should not have to do domestic chores."

**47%** OF MEN report being on the parenting sidelines, seldom or never participating in the daily care of their own children. BUT THE DATA ALSO SHOW THE OPPOSITE: HOW CARING FATHERS CAN EFFECTIVELY TRANSMIT THE VALUE OF CARE WORK TO THEIR CHILDREN. Men who are equally or primarily involved in care work today.



- Men whose fathers or male caregivers modeled equitable involvement in domestic tasks in the childhood home
- Men who had no such example of male involvement in the home growing up

AND, WHILE MOST MEN DO NOT APPEAR TO ENGAGE WITH THE MORE BURDENSOME TASKS OF CHILDREARING, THEY DO PARTICIPATE IN WAYS THEY FIND MOST ACCESSIBLE. **3 out of 4 men** do various leisure activities with their children, such as play and help with their schoolwork.



And more involvement might be on the horizon...

**88% of men** say that "they would rather spend more time with their children than work."

Does this mean they would like to be more involved in any and all care work, regardless of how fun or rewarding? That is still unclear and should be the subject of further inquiry.



### NOW... WHAT DO WOMEN THINK ABOUT MEN'S CONTRIBUTIONS TO UNPAID CARE AND DOMESTIC AND WORK TODAY?

While over half of men say that they are involved fathers, women report that their partners do less. This suggests that some men may have responded to these questions in socially desirable ways. Report that men participate equally or are primarily responsible for...

The daily care of children.

At least one of the following domestic tasks: washing clothes, cleaning the house, cleaning the bathroom, or cooking for the household.



53%

Men Women

IN FACT, MEN SEEM TO SYSTEMATICALLY UNDERESTIMATE WOMEN'S ROLE IN HOUSEHOLD AND CAREGIVING RESPONSIBILITIES, WHILE OVERESTIMATING THEIR OWN SHARE OF THE LABOR.

Men are more likely to state that household tasks are "shared," while women are more likely to say that they usually do the tasks "on their own." This is true across all household and caregiving categories that we asked about.

### **45%** OF MEN

say they bathe and change their children's diapers as often or even more often than women.

Women's perspective is different:

# 23% 77%

- Women who agree with men's assessment
- Women who say that they are the ones to "usually or always" carry out these tasks

### THIS DISCONNECT BETWEEN MEN'S AND WOMEN'S PERSPECTIVES HAS IMPLICATIONS FOR THE QUALITY AND SATISFACTION OF COUPLE'S RELATIONSHIPS.

Men report more satisfaction than women with the division of labor within the household (96% of men are "satisfied or very satisfied" vs. 77% of women).

They are also more likely to express satisfaction in their relationship more generally (74% of men are "satisfied or very satisfied" vs. 65% of women). Meanwhile 2x more women than men report quarreling with their partners "often," and significantly fewer women seek the support of their partners when they feel sad, anxious, or frustrated (46% of men vs. 31% of women).

#### **QUICK TAKEAWAYS:** Fatherhood and Caregiving

- Men and women seem to understand "care work" differently. Men mostly define care as play and leisure activities with children; women understand it as all the physical and emotional care that goes into raising children and running the household. In other words, care work is, for now, a siloed definition rather than a shared vision.
- Men see engaged fatherhood as a task that is light and fun, while they continue to see mothers as responsible for the bulk of the health, care, and discipline of children.

#### • But men's positive involvement is key.

The generational cycles of care show the positive influence that men's role in the household can have for future generations. It's important to understand how to seize this opportunity.

### MASCULINITIES AND VIOLENCE

- What are the popular opinions and social norms around the use of violence in relationships?
- Are these opinions reflective of reality at home?
- What drives the use of violent and coercive practices, particularly against women?

#### THE VAST MAJORITY OF BOLIVIANS SAY THEY STAND AGAINST THE USE OF VIOLENCE IN INTIMATE PARTNERSHIPS.

When asked about intimate partner violence, most Bolivian men and women report very low support for violence against women. Agree or strongly agree that...



### AND YET, THESE PROGRESSIVE PERSONAL VIEWS ARE OFTEN IN TENSION WITH MEN'S AND WOMEN'S ACCOUNTS OF THE REALITIES AROUND THEM AND EVEN IN THEIR OWN HOMES.

When asked about what is commonplace or acceptable to others in their community, 1 in 4 men and women said violence is tolerated, and almost half said that it is in fact commonly practiced in their community. Agree or strongly agree that...



Men Women

### VIOLENCE, IN FACT, REMAINS A COMMON EXPERIENCE FOR MANY BOLIVIANS IN CHILDHOOD AND IN THEIR EARLY RELATIONSHIPS.

• 41% OF MEN and 34% OF

**WOMEN** report having been physically hurt by a caregiver in their youth.

- **15% OF WOMEN** report having been sexually assaulted in their youth.
- 20% OF WOMEN report that their first sexual encounter was forced or coerced.

- **1** out of every **3** men and women witnessed violence committed against their mother by their father or another male partner.
- Almost half of respondents reported witnessing some form of psychological violence against their mother by a male companion.

IN BOLIVIA, LIKE IN MANY OTHER COUNTRIES WHERE IMAGES SURVEYS WERE CONDUCTED, WE SEE HARMFUL CYCLES OF VIOLENCE PASSED DOWN THROUGH THE GENERATIONS.

\*Severe physical punishment is defined as engaging in at least one of the following acts: slapping the face or hitting the head; hitting or slapping any part of the body with the hand or fist; hitting the buttocks or another part of the body with a hard object (for example a belt, a broom, etc.); or beating over and over with full force.

\*\*Physical violence means ever having engaged in at least one of the following: slapping your partner or throwing something at her that could hurt her; pushing, cornering or pulling partner's hair; hitting partner with a fist or something else that could hurt her; kicking, dragging, beating partner; choking or burning partner on purpose; threatening to or actually using a gun, knife, or other weapon against partner. Bolivian men who, in their youth, **witnessed** violence against their mother at the hands of their father or another male partner are almost

**3X** MORE LIKELY to use harsh physical punishment\* against their own children as adults.

Men who **witnessed** violence against their mother are also

**3.5X** MORE LIKELY to commit physical abuses against their own partners as adults.

Men who, on the other hand, experienced violence themselves as kids were

**2.5X** MORE LIKELY to use physical intimate partner violence\*\* against their partners or wives.

### MEN'S REPORTED USE (AND WOMEN'S REPORTED EXPERIENCE) OF INTIMATE PARTNER VIOLENCE IS STILL HIGH...

* Of those who said they experienced or used violence in their lifetime/ever	% MEN (USE)		% WOMEN (EXPERIENCE)	
	Ever	In the Last Year*	Ever	In the Last Year*
Economic Violence	36	89	40	88
Emotional Violence	44	97	51	81
Physical Violence	23	96	32	76
Sexual Violence	6	45	13	35
Combined: Physical and Sexual Violence	25	100	35	99

#### ...AS IS CONTROL OVER WOMEN'S BEHAVIOR IN BOLIVIAN PARTNERSHIPS.

In fact, 61% of Bolivian men and women report that men regularly use at least one of the following controlling behaviors in their current or most recent relationships.



# THE FACTORS MOST CORRELATED WITH MEN'S USE OF PHYSICAL VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN ARE:

- **SOCIODEMOGRAPHIC:** Older age\*, lower educational attainment, rural residence
- CHILDHOOD EXPERIENCES: Less involvement of fathers in childhood\*, presence of violence in childhood\*, experience of violence in childhood\*
- ATTITUDES AND SOCIAL NORMS: Less equitable gender attitudes\*, subscribes to more rigid notions of masculinity\*, perceptions of community tolerance for violence\*, and perceptions of violence commonly used by others in the community\*
- **RELATIONAL FACTORS:** Use of control in a relationship\* and frequent quarreling between intimate partners\*

All of these factors are also correlated strongly with men's use of violence against children, highlighting the strong intersection of these types of violence and the need to address the underlying factors that feed both types of violence.

\*These factors are also related to men's use of emotional or psychological violence A CERTAIN RELUCTANCE TO DEALING WITH THESE REALITIES IS APPARENT AMONG SOME. FOR ONE, SURVIVORS OF VIOLENCE (ESPECIALLY SEXUAL VIOLENCE) ARE OFTEN BLAMED FOR THE VIOLENCE THEY EXPERIENCED. **26% OF WOMEN** said that "if a woman does not defend herself, it cannot be considered rape."

#### **39%** OF MEN and **31%** OF WOMEN said that "when a woman has been raped, it is important to know if she has

been with many men or has a bad reputation." MANY ALSO DISPUTE THE EXISTENCE OF RAPE IN THE CONTEXT OF MARRIAGE, SHOWING LIMITED BELIEF IN WOMEN'S BODILY AUTONOMY IN THE CONTEXT OF A PARTNERSHIP. 2 in 5 men and women said that "rape in the context of marriage does not exist."



1 in 3 men said that "if a man wants sex, the partner should accept it."



AND THERE IS PALPABLE RESISTANCE TO MECHANISMS THAT WOULD HOLD PERPETRATORS OF VIOLENCE ACCOUNTABLE AND PROVIDE PROTECTION FOR SURVIVORS. Percent of respondents who agree or totally agree with statements about Law 348: Ensuring a Life Free from Violence for Women\*

52%

53%

70%

"Law 348 is too hard on aggressors."

"The law increases family conflict."

"Women use this law to wrongly accuse men."

\*Questions only asked if respondents knew of this law.

## SO HOW CAN WE GET MEN TO SHOW UP TO PREVENT VIOLENCE?

# THE IMPACTS OF VIOLENCE ARE PERVASIVE - NOT JUST FOR WOMEN AND CHILDREN, BUT FOR MEN THEMSELVES.

SHOWING MEN THAT **VIOLENCE HAS CONSEQUENCES FOR** THEIR OWN HEALTH AND WELL-BEING CAN **HELP THEM GRASP ITS PROFOUND AND** LIFELONG NEGATIVE **EFFECTS AND** MITIGATE THEIR USE **OF VIOLENCE AGAINST** WOMEN AND CHILDREN.

Bolivian men who, as children, **witnessed** violence against their mother at the hands of their father or another male partner are

## **3.3X** MORE LIKELY to have problems due to

alcohol consumption.

Those who **experienced** violence as children were



to have had family, social, or work problems due to their drinking in the last year.

Bolivian men who **experienced** violence in their childhood and also those who **witnessed** violence against their mothers as children are

**2X MORE LIKELY** to meet screening thresholds

#### **QUICK TAKEAWAYS:** Masculinities and Violence

- The data support the idea that there are strong linkages between experiencing and witnessing violence in childhood and men's use of violence against women and children as adults.
  - It's important to see violence in the context of generational cycles and develop both immediate support for survivors and longer-term programming for prevention and mitigation.
- Even though people publicly reject violence in the context of a relationship, violence is highly normalized and frequently experienced by individuals in their personal lives and communities.

- The use of violent and controlling acts in intimate partnerships is prevalent, and the factors associated with men's use of this violence are also correlated with their use of violence against children in the home.
  - Efforts around violence prevention cannot address one without the other.
- There is also a strong pushback against legal measures that promote accountability for perpetrators of violence and support for survivors, creating an enabling environment for these cycles to continue.
- Lastly, more open conversations need to be had with men about how the continuation of violence has harmful consequences for them too, both mentally and physically.

# CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS

### BUILD ON EXISTING GENDER-EQUITABLE ATTITUDES AND BEHAVIORS AND PASS THEM ON TO THE NEXT GENERATION

- Male respondents largely state their support for gender equality. That provides a strong platform to build on, by holding them accountable to the gender equality ideals they support and showing them concrete actions they can take at home and in public spaces to achieve that ideal.
- Results show the long-lasting impact of both harmful and positive attitudes and behaviors in relation to gender equality.
  - Children who had positive gender-equitable relationships modeled for them during their youth were more likely to engage in similarly positive relationships as adults.
- It is important to build on this momentum via campaigns, interventions, and policies that help men see themselves as models or mentors for the future.

### BUILD ON POSITIVE ATTITUDINAL CHANGE TO FACILITATE TRANSFORMATION OF SOCIAL NORMS

- The beliefs around gender equality that most people express are not necessarily reflected in their daily realities and behaviors.
- It is important that future interventions and initiatives take a deeper social norms behavioral change approach from the outset.
  - Practitioners should identify specific behaviors that men can engage in, such as attending prenatal visits, and participating in childcare and parent training, and use nudges to promote broader change.
- Adding a behavioral science approach can close the gap between public opinions and private actions.
  - It can motivate individuals and communities to shift their behaviors and approaches.

# ELEVATE CAMPAIGNS AND MESSAGES THAT SHIFT THE NARRATIVE AROUND GENDER EQUALITY

- In order to make way for the redistribution of caregiving, messages or images around care and domestic work should shift away from only showing mothers or women and include positive images of male caregivers instead.
  - It's important to promote messages that reinforce that all members of the family, including men, can and should be responsible for caregiving.
- High levels of homophobia and stereotypes of the LGBTQIA+ community also demonstrate the need for positive images of diverse sexual orientations and gender identities.
- Raising awareness about the root causes of sexual violence against women within the community will be an important part of building support for survivors.

#### ENSURE THAT PREVENTION OF INTIMATE PARTNER VIOLENCE INCLUDES A STRONG FOCUS ON INTERVENTIONS FOR PARENT AND COUPLES

- Childhood exposure to violence and the link between violence against women and violence against children demonstrate the need for a more holistic approach to intrafamilial violence.
  - Gender-transformative parent training programs that involve both men and women work to address intimate partner violence and violence against children, illuminate their impacts, and provide the steps to break generational cycles of violence.
  - Psychosocial approaches to address the trauma associated with witnessing violence are another strategy to start undoing the trauma passed on from parents to children.

### **BUILD RESEARCH THAT IDENTIFIES PROMISING PRACTICES**

- The IMAGES survey highlighted a key challenge to transformational change—men's high levels of satisfaction with the current division of labor and the state of their relationships.
  - It begs the question of whether men have any motivation or incentive to change their household dynamics.
- National and workplace policy should lean into men's desire to spend more time with their children by, for example, promoting equal and non-transferable paternity leave.
  - Future research should identify levers or entry points to motivate further changes within households. These could include:
    - Building on men's desire to spend more time with their children;
    - Developing workplace campaigns and partnerships to encourage and emphasize men's time spent with their children;
    - Providing personal stories from men who participate in their households in positive ways; or
    - Engaging celebrities and influencers to highlight their stories of positive, equitable involvement in caregiving.

### REINFORCE TRANSFORMATIVE CHANGE AT THE POLICY AND INSTITUTIONAL LEVEL

- Promote broader community awareness and buy-in for laws and policies that reinforce women's rights.
  - Policymakers should ensure that the language, provisions, and parameters of planned and existing legislation do not reinforce existing norms, and that they support policies that are more transformative.
- Develop a deeper understanding of structural biases that reinforce gender inequalities within institutions, especially those that work with families, children, and women, and work to transform spaces to promote shared responsibilities between men and women.
- Invest in public education campaigns, with a focus on men as appropriate, about why gender equality is necessary and how it benefits everyone.
  - This could use messages that appeal to aspects of gender equality that many men already support.
  - Frame intimate partner violence prevention as creating a world for all Bolivians that is free from violence and call on men to be positive bystanders and call out violence when they see it.







Thank you to our partners and colleagues at CEGIE-UPB and Promundo-US, the members of our expert advisory committee, and the Swedish Embassy in Bolivia for making this work possible.

#### Production:

Blossom (Design/Layout)

Caitlin Jones and Tiziana Laudato (Copyediting/translation)

